Meeting Date: November 20, 2019

Meeting Location: California Suite
101 Twin Dolphin Drive
Redwood City, California

Board Members Present: Susan Alvaro, Hector Camacho, Jr., Jim Cannon, Beverly Gerard, Rod Hsiao, Ted Lempert

Board Members Absent: Joe Ross

Staff Officials Present: Nancy Magee, Secretary
Jennifer Perna, Executive Assistant

Other Staff Present: Kim Bambao, Jesus Contreras, Joy Dardenelle, Yangxue Dong, Mefula Fairley, Jennifer Frentress, Michelle Holdt, Jenéé Littrell, Patricia Love, Lori Musso, Bradley Ostrander, Denise Porterfield, Jared Prolo, Robert Wachtel Pronovost, Clarissa Tom

Youth Commissioner Liaison Present: Sydney Mufarreh

1. OPENING ITEMS

A. Call to Order

Board President Hector Camacho, Jr. called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

B. Approval of Agenda

After a motion by Ms. Gerard and a second by Mr. Lempert, the Board approved, by a vote of six in favor (Alvaro, Camacho, Cannon, Gerard, Hsiao, and Lempert), none opposed, and one absent (Ross), the November 20, 2019, agenda as presented.

Superintendent Magee then introduced and acknowledged student musicians from San Mateo High School, who performed as a string quartet prior to the Board meeting in recognition of the 2019 Visual, Performing, and Media Arts Strategic Plan. Students Jonathan, Ronald, Ruki, and Christina were joined by Attilio Tribuzi, the Musical Director at San Mateo High School and Arts Coordinator for the San Mateo Union High School District.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no persons wishing to address the Board.
3. **EMPLOYEE OF THE MONTH**

   A. **November 2019 Employee of the Month, Yangxue Dong, Educational Data Analyst, Systems for District Improvement, Instructional Services Division**

   Board President Camacho recognized the November 2019 Employee of the Month, Yangxue Dong, Educational Data Analyst, Systems for District Improvement, Instructional Services Division. Board President Camacho congratulated Ms. Dong on behalf of the Board and presented her with a check and commemorative clock.

   Board President Camacho then recognized and welcomed Sydney Mufarreh, Youth Commissioner Liaison, in her first official meeting at the dais.

4. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

   A. **November 6, 2019, Regular Board Meeting**

   After a motion by Ms. Gerard and a second by Mr. Lempert, the Board approved, by a vote of six in favor (Alvaro, Camacho, Cannon, Gerard, Hsiao, and Lempert), none opposed, and one absent (Ross), the Minutes of the November 6, 2019, Regular Meeting as presented.

5. **CONSENT AGENDA**

   B. **Receive Staffing Reports**

   C. **Adopt Joint Resolution No. 19-54 Endorsing December 9-15, 2019, as Computer Science Education Week: Hour of Code**

   D. **Adopt Joint Resolution No. 19-55 Endorsing the Declaration of the Rights of All Students to Equity in Arts Learning**

   After a motion by Ms. Gerard and a second by Mr. Hsiao, the Board approved, by a vote of six in favor (Alvaro, Camacho, Cannon, Gerard, Hsiao, and Lempert), none opposed, and one absent (Ross), the Consent Agenda.

6. **INSTRUCTIONAL SERVICES**


   Joy Dardenelle, Administrator, District Improvement and Support, introduced Jesus Contreras as SMCOE’s Coordinator, Local, State, and Federal Support who oversees Williams Settlement Monitoring. Ms. Dardenelle congratulated Coordinator Contreras on his upcoming new role as Chief Business Official in the Cabrillo Unified School District (CUSD).
Coordinator Contreras explained *Williams* Settlement Monitoring visits are conducted yearly by County Office of Education staff for all schools whose 2012 Academic Performance Indicator (API) was in the lowest three deciles under No Child Left Behind accountability.

Coordinator Contreras said each of the identified schools receive a documentation review and a validation visit. He also stated annual and quarterly reports are provided to the San Mateo County Board of Education, the County Board of Supervisors, and the local School Board of each monitored school.

Coordinator Contreras discussed the scope of *Williams* reviews which includes monitoring of sufficiency of instructional materials, whether facilities are in “good repair,” teacher vacancies and mis-assignments, and School Accountability Report Cards (SARCs).

Coordinator Contreras reviewed the monitoring results which showed 349 classrooms/classes were reviewed. All classrooms were found to have sufficient textbooks and instructional materials, and so no five-day letters were issued. Coordinator Contreras also explained as school districts continue to adopt digital materials, *Williams* monitoring checks that all students have access to instructional materials both at home and at school.

Coordinator Contreras reported the Facilities review is based on the California Facilities Inspection Tool (FIT). The team inspected 1,201 areas of school facilities and found zero extreme deficiencies which could endanger students or staff.

Additionally, Coordinator Contreras shared all reviewed SARCS met the basic reporting requirements on instructional materials, credentialing, and facilities.

Coordinator Contreras described the 2019-2020 pilot of a new process for monitoring mis-assignments and vacancies which uses data from the California Longitudinal Pupil Achievement Data System (CALPADS). Although there are still a few kinks to work out in this new process, the team identified eight mis-assignments for the 2018-2019 school year, all of which were ultimately remedied.

Mr. Cannon asked how many years the *Williams* monitoring has occurred and why it became necessary. Coordinator Contreras responded this monitoring became necessary when a lawsuit against California claimed disadvantaged students were being served in schools in poor repair, without sufficient instructional materials, and by teachers who were not appropriately credentialed. Coordinator Contreras also noted that County Offices of Education were charged with monitoring of identified schools, and part of the settlement was to visit schools in the lower three deciles of program improvement, creating the *Williams* list of monitored schools. Coordinator Contreras explained when the Local Control Funding Formula—Local Control Accountability Plan (LCFF-LCAP) became the law in 2013, the State Board of Education made the provisions of the *Williams* Act its priority. These same schools continue to be monitored because the legislators have not yet created legislation to change which schools are selected. Coordinator Contreras shared that AB 1761, which would align *Williams*-identified schools with the current state accountability system, was introduced in February 2019 and is currently moving through the legislature.
INSTRUCTIONAL SERVICES (continued)

Mr. Hsiao asked if the schools initially identified for Williams were those in the bottom three deciles of the API, what system is currently being used to identify schools. Coordinator Contreras clarified that although current legislation calls for three-year cycles, the schools initially identified seven years ago based on their 2012 API scores, are still being monitored. He said there is a need for revised legislation to identify schools.

Ms. Gerard asked what happens when classroom safety and sanitary issues documented the previous year have not been corrected in the current year. Coordinator Contreras explained each district’s local Board is informed, and it is their job to see that the improvements are made.

Board President Camacho asked about the eight mis-assigned educators and how they ended up in the mis-assigned category. Coordinator Contreras answered there is often a shortage of teachers and those who are not fully credentialed may be temporarily assigned to classes until other measures can be taken to resolve the situation. Board President Camacho asked about Williams being an annual review and whether educators who are mis-assigned, might be corrected for purposes of the monitoring visit, but then mis-assigned again. Coordinator Contreras responded there is legislation looking at addressing this issue for Williams schools.

Associate Superintendent Musso added that all teaching credentials are monitored every year by SMCOE credential analysts assigned to each district. Coordinator Contreras confirmed the data he uses for monitoring is obtained from Ms. Musso’s department. Board President Camacho asked whether each district has a credential analyst, along with the credential analysts at SMCOE. Associate Superintendent Musso confirmed this was accurate.

Board President Camacho thanked Coordinator Contreras for his years of informative presentations, wished him “felicidades”, and said he’s confident Coordinator Contreras will do an excellent job at the Cabrillo Unified School District.

B. Receive Report on California Assessment of Student Performance and Progress (CAASPP) 2019 Results

Associate Superintendent Jennifer Frentress introduced Joy Dardenelle, Administrator, District Improvement and Support, and Jared Prolo, Director, Research, Accountability, and Continuous Improvement to provide an update and analysis of 2019 county-wide CAASPP results.

Administrator Dardenelle said the Systems for District Improvement team supports districts in developing plans that identify key priorities, reflect progress monitoring using research-based strategies, involve meaningful stakeholder engagement, and match the priorities to sustainable funding.

Director Prolo explained the API measure in the previous accountability system was 100% comprised of assessment data, but the Dashboard accountability system works differently and involves two data releases. He noted the first data release is the CAASPP, a one point in time measurement of academic progress for English-language arts, mathematics, and science. Director Prolo explained this information, along with other data, feeds into the Dashboard, the second data
release. He stated the goal of this process is to support districts and their communities in understanding the importance of the Dashboard release, especially for accountability purposes. Director Prolo explained the CAASPP data release is useful for inquiry and helping districts better understand their systems for instruction while the Dashboard utilizes multiple data sources, looks at information in a more comprehensive way, and is best used for accountability purposes.

Director Prolo explained CAASPP data is most effective in identifying trends, as it allows leaders to see where successes appear and to understand areas of challenge. He said CAASPP results are reported in two ways: 1) the percentage of students in each performance band who met or exceeded standards, and 2) the mean scaled score.

Director Prolo then shared his analysis of the overall countywide trends for English-language arts and mathematics, explaining the 2019 data is generally flat with little change in positive or negative directions. He noted there is more improvement than decline, but little variability in student performance within the one-year sample.

Director Prolo stated there have now been five years of CAASPP test administration, and he displayed data showing the change in percentage of students who met or exceeded standards over the course of the five test administrations. Director Prolo continued by explaining he aggregated and analyzed CAASPP data, looking for student groups in districts that had consistent improvement across all the administrations. He stated some school districts had individual student groups experiencing positive growth each year, but he noted Redwood City School District (RCSD) as an example of a school district that demonstrated improvement across multiple student groups, including historically disadvantaged student groups, over all five administrations.

Administrator Dardenelle pointed out for Redwood City School District there were significant and consistent percentage increases from year to year. For example, students identified as Hispanic-Latino increased 5.0%, 2.0%, 5.3%, and 0.7% over four years in math, and students identified as Two or More Races increased 10.0%, 2.5%, 5.8%, and 5.0% over four years in math. She offered one potential factor for Redwood City School District’s improvement over time might be consistency in implementing change initiatives, including the comprehensive Sobrato Early Academic Language (SEAL) program which specifically supports English Language Development and takes multiple years to fully implement districtwide.

Administrator Dardenelle also highlighted the Golden Ticket, a program focusing on district-wide professional learning and expectations, as a second potential factor in RCSD’s improvement. Administrator Dardenelle said the program identifies clear goals for what teachers should be doing in the classroom to support students in literacy and other content areas and is designed and articulated for both administrative leadership and teachers.

Director Prolo discussed a desire to understand the challenges around the equity gap between the performance of all students and students who are historically underserved, specifically students who are economically disadvantaged, students with disabilities, and students who are English Learners.
INSTRUCTIONAL SERVICES (continued)

Director Prolo stated the greatest challenge is addressing this equity gap. He reminded the Board that looking at mean scale scores is helpful because for the first time, multiple years of student performance can be compared. Director Prolo clarified that a change in scale score corresponds to a change in learning, so the expectation is that scale scores will increase each year and scores can be compared each year even though they related to different tests. Director Prolo shared a graph showing how some student groups are, on average, meeting standards and continuing to grow, while other student groups are below meeting standards. He summarized that all student groups are growing, but some are not growing enough.

Director Prolo then shared a chart showing “met standard” as a horizontal growth line with all students group performances compared to that line. He summarized that Asian, White, and Two or More Race student groups perform above the “met standard” line and are flattening out, while other student groups fall below the “met standard” line and show a downward trend line. Director Prolo described this as an example of the equity gap, where students are not catching up to or keeping pace with their peers, and are actually falling further behind the longer they spend in school. Director Prolo said this highlights the need for significant work supporting historically underserved student groups.

Ms. Alvaro thanked Administrator Dardenelle and Director Prolo for the presentation. She asked for clarification on the slide “Where do Successes Appear,” and Director Prolo responded the numbers on the chart indicated a change in the percentage of students meeting proficiency for student groups from one year to the next. Ms. Alvaro asked whether the scores were for the same students as they advance through the grades. Director Prolo answered the scores were based on data of all students in the district in 2015 compared to all students in the district in 2016. He further clarified that a change of 8.0% represents an eight percent increase in the number of students who met standard from one year to the next year. Ms. Alvaro asked what was happening to cause an increase, then decrease, then increase, then decrease, especially for several student groups. Director Prolo responded this may be due to small student samples, because the smaller the sample size, the more volatile it will be. He said this is a statistical challenge for districts with important but statistically small student populations. Ms. Alvaro stated it was interesting that most student groups displayed stability in increases or decreases, but in some cases the numbers bounced around a lot, which caught her eye.

Mr. Lempert commented how the old system allowed him to use the API number to see which schools were doing well given their demographics and asked if similar data could be produced. Director Prolo answered there are some tools to provide such information but using the Dashboard data and not solely the CAASPP results would be most effective in exploring this data, especially trends in which student groups fall in the green or blue because they are greatly increased. He added the Dashboard is structured for more sophisticated reporting and uses both status and change. He noted this is where stories will emerge more accurately.

Mr. Lempert commented CAASPP data should show non-Basic Aid district scores going down because they are getting less money from the state, and scores for students who are economically disadvantaged and English learners should be going up because they are receiving more funding. He asked if more money makes a difference and whether the districts are using the money to target
Board of Education Meeting  
November 20, 2019  

**INSTRUCTIONAL SERVICES (continued)**

schools serving these students. He also asked what should be communicated to the public about this issue. Mr. Lempert said the public is always being told that schools need more money. He questioned whether the schools are spending the money on the appropriate students.

Superintendent Magee responded that this very question was discussed at the California County Superintendents Educational Services Association (CCSESA) quarterly meeting as the Dashboard moves into its third year. She added that part of the County Office of Education LCAP oversight is to explore whether LCFF dollars are being applied effectively for the appropriate students.

Administrator Dardenelle added that digging deeper with districts about LCAP and continuous improvement helps drive budget decisions. She said she appreciates the Dashboard including data points about academics, suspension rates, chronic absenteeism, parent engagement, and facilities in order to ensure basic conditions are being met for all students. Administrator Dardenelle also shared that although the new LCAP template has not yet been approved, one issue being analyzed in the new template is the prioritization of goals, giving districts the opportunity to create both general and specific, measurable, time-bound goals in order to address specific issues. She explained a lot of money gets placed into LCAPs and can seem diluted, but the new template provides an option to prioritize support for specific student groups based on data from the CAASPP and Dashboard.

Mr. Hsiao asked what work was being done to identify the root causes of successes and failures, especially as depicted on the line graphs showing how cohorts of the same student groups perform over time. He shared his appreciation for Director Prolo’s alarm regarding the decline in performance for some student groups and expressed a desire to know which strategies being implemented with LCAP money show promise and are having a positive impact, as illustrated in the Redwood City School District case study.

Mr. Hsiao asked whether the 25% increase in math performance from 2015–2016 for Filipino students was due to a small sample size. Director Prolo said he suspected it was. He added there were huge gains statewide after the second CAASPP administration in 2015-2016, because students oriented to the new computer-based testing system. He said scores evened out after the second administration. Mr. Hsiao expressed concern for the Black or African American student group, a small demographic group in San Mateo County, but showing a lot of data in the red.

Mr. Hsiao then asked Director Prolo to clarify his comments that the Dashboard is a better way of looking at district accountability while the CAASPP is better for effectiveness. Director Prolo explained the CAASPP supports the inquiry process and is the beginning of a problem statement as part of an improvement project to identify unexpected gaps in performance. He said a district can launch into a root-cause analysis using additional tools and resources to understand why the results are being produced. He stated this is the process for lasting improvement, and CAASPP data is only the first step in that process. Director Prolo stated part of his team’s role is to support district assessment and instructional leaders to do inquiry with their staff.

Mr. Hsiao asked about the non-academic factors cited by Administrator Dardenelle earlier in the presentation, for example with mobility trends for transitory or displaced populations, which affect student learning. Administrator Dardenelle shared her team is thinking about how to provide
additional support at the site level to identify schools who are doing well and those needing additional support.

Mr. Cannon asked what it takes to improve student achievement and for Director Prolo’s thoughts on the idea that “we know what to do, but do not have the will to do it.” Director Prolo answered that getting things to stick is the difficult part. He stated as a teacher and administrator he has seen good ideas that, when backed by resources, result in big gains in student achievement, but when it becomes difficult to sustain commitment to those resources, the results are often not permanent. Director Prolo said the harder question is whether improvement that sticks can become part of the organizational culture, regardless of resources. He also said structures are required to make change last. Mr. Cannon agreed that systemic improvement often doesn’t stick when there are structural changes, such as good Principals retiring, moving, or getting promoted.

Mr. Cannon then discussed root causes and shared his observation that, in general, students who perform better typically come from more affluent backgrounds and have more support through families, cities, and school than students from backgrounds of poverty. He added in San Mateo County, districts with large percentages of underperforming students often have less money, and poverty plays a large role in student performance and test scores. Mr. Cannon asked to what extent SMCOE can change this. He added he knows the issue is being tackled in San Mateo County, but he is not sure how it can be overcome. Director Prolo agreed this is an extremely challenging problem. He discussed how a colleague from San Bernardino Unified School district is mapping poverty in neighborhoods and using housing-adjusted poverty measures to make maps and layering assessment data on top to try and understand the issue. Director Prolo reiterated this is a complex problem that needs more attending and understanding.

Mr. Lempert commented the issue is based on more than poverty because there are schools with all students receiving free and reduced-price lunch and most being English Language Learners, who graduate students ready to attend four-year colleges. He reiterated the old accountability system highlighted schools with scores of “10” across the board with similar demographics and prompted the question of what they were doing right. Mr. Lempert expressed a desire to find out what schools are doing things right. He agreed with Mr. Cannon that perhaps these schools did well only for a few years, but stated part of education is to change this. Mr. Cannon agreed with all of Mr. Lempert’s comments, adding the importance of great leadership, which inevitably changes, along with School Boards and Superintendents. He shared this discussion is part of being a healthy educational leader who understands issues and works to improve struggles.

Board President Camacho asked if cohort growth were tracked for other cohorts in 2015-2016, starting in sixth grade, would similar trends be seen. Director Prolo answered similar trends would be seen across cohorts for both English-language arts and mathematics. Board President Camacho asked if similar trends were seen between 8th and 9th grade, as this transition can be significant as students may be changing districts. He also asked about similar trends from 8th to 11th grade. Director Prolo responded such data was more difficult to track and shared, as the actual measurement of the expected learning between 8th and 11th grade is not as large as assumed. He added it is tough to trace those three years but roughly the same story emerges.
INSTRUCTIONAL SERVICES (continued)

Board President Camacho said the charts displayed in Director Prolo’s presentation are important because the “telling of the story” is becoming essential to Board members who are being asked to advocate for more money, with nothing to show for the dollars currently there. He shared understanding that Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) has a requirement that spending be site-specific, and asked if California has adopted site-specific requirements for how dollars are spent. Director Prolo answered that California and Kansas did not choose economic growth-expected modeling as part of their accountability systems. He explained California does not have this value-add data, but there are districts that have tried to figure out their value-add to help with questions regarding economic impact. SMCOE currently does not have access to robust value-add data.

Board President Camacho asked whether SMCOE could address this with districts through the LCAP process. He shared he has been at the school site and feels nervous about the Dashboard because more than just “green and blue” must be analyzed in order to not lose students. Board President Camacho shared feeling there are not enough visualizations to tell the story. He shared how the comprehensive report, “Achievement in Motion”, isolated specific districts with promising practices and trends and said he hopes to find those districts again. Director Prolo shared he did not have an answer to all of these questions yet, but he has ideas which include building capacity with the team and plotting the direction in which to head. Board President Camacho commented the wait is incredibly frustrating and shared appreciation for the presentation.

Administrator Dardenelle stated the phrase “operationalizing equity” keeps coming up for her, along with the idea of LCAPs being the way for counties and districts to create sustainable plans independent of one excellent leader who may come and then go. Board President Camacho shared appreciation for Administrator Dardenelle’s comments, adding the educator piece is interesting because educators are hired on 3-5 year timelines based on the expectation for how long they will stay. He said these timelines must be factored in hiring models aiming for sustained growth. He shared attending a National Association for Latino Elected and Appointed Officials (NALEO) conference where a Superintendent from San Antonio spoke about neighborhood heat maps, like those in San Bernadino, which is another huge example of scaling.

Board President Camacho spoke of the Edunomics lab at Georgetown University which is looking at school funding, how it is spent, and how it is tied to value-add.

Mr. Hsiao thanked Administrator Dardenelle and Director Prolo for their presentation and for answering the Board’s questions. He shared the Board is keenly interested in this topic and wants to be part of the learning journey. He would love Director Prolo’s team to return with updates on their strategic plan process moving forward. Board President Camacho requested Director Prolo also share ways in which the Board can help.

C. Receive Presentation of SMCOE’s 2019 Visual, Performing, and Media Arts Strategic Plan

Associate Superintendent Jennifer Frentress introduced Michelle Holdt, Coordinator, Visual and Performing Arts, and Dr. Lisa Edsall Giglio, Director of Education, TheatreWorks Silicon Valley,
to update the Board on SMCOE’s Visual, Performing, and Media Arts Strategic Plan and the exciting work being embarked upon.

Coordinator Holdt explained she and Dr. Edsall Giglio have been co-leading the Visual and Performing Arts Strategic Planning committee, and she introduced members of the committee present in the audience: Graciela Eulate, Visual Arts Teacher, Jefferson Union High School District, Mara Grimes, Arts Education Consultant, Linda Janklow, Founder, Peopleologie, and Kristina Ayala, Visual Arts Teacher and District Arts Lead, San-Mateo Foster City School District.

Coordinator Holdt stated the new Visual, Performing, and Media Arts Strategic Plan is intentionally and artistically designed as an accordion book and is modeled after creative collage bookmaking strategies to pull in the reader so the reading of the plan feels like a creative experience. Coordinator Holdt explained the planning process began by working for three full days earlier in the year with Peggy Burt, a facilitator with the California Alliance for Arts Education. She described the team then worked to write the plan from March through September.

Coordinator Holdt shared data shows 73% of students in Ohio participate in the arts compared to 39% of students in California. She explained that Create California is launching across the state to help the public understand the value of arts education. She elaborated that public perception of arts education is limited and does not include an understanding of the importance of the arts in teaching creativity. Coordinator Holdt explained the Create California campaign is endorsed by many statewide agencies including the California Alliance for Arts Education, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association (CCSESA), the California State Parent Teacher Association (PTA), the California Arts Council, and the California Department of Education (CDE).

Coordinator Holdt shared 2018-2019 data from California Arts Education Database showing 45% of San Mateo County middle and high school students were enrolled in arts classes, broken down as follows:

- 17% in music courses
- 21% in visual arts courses
- 4% in theater courses
- 2% in dance courses
- 5% in other courses

Dr. Edsall Giglio discussed the accordion book style of the strategic plan, the need for student inquiry and ability to connect the dots, both ideas which overlap across disciplines and allow critical thinking. She outlined the simple, sustainable, addressable, and actionable strategic plan directions:

- Relevant discipline content
- High caliber instruction
- Resilient programs

Coordinator Holdt described how she and Dr. Edsall Giglio worked together a few years back to produce a documentary film designed as a statewide advocacy tool to educate school Boards, PTAs,
and school sites councils as to how the arts have historically been cut from California schools since Proposition 13 in 1978. She talked about the correlation between those with access to arts and the impact of the arts, specifically for low socio-economic students and students of color, who are least likely to receive access to arts in schools across the state and the county. Coordinator Holdt noted that multiple studies show when the arts are infused in schools, drop-out rates decrease and engagement and learning increases. She summarized that access to the arts is an equity issue which must be addressed.

Coordinator Holdt described a public community launch for Create San Mateo County, where messaging and branding will be shared and celebrated on January 15, 2020 at B Street and Vine in San Mateo, from 4:30 to 6:30 pm. She invited all to attend the event celebrating the arts in San Mateo County.

Dr. Edsall Giglio discussed the issues of asking for more money, addressing business support for local arts, and seeking people with critical thinking skills and creativity. She expressed appreciation for the opportunity to share the strategic plan with the Board.

Youth Commissioner Mufarreh commented that as a senior in high school she has taken arts, drama, and dance courses, and asked for examples of what the implementation of the plan will look like. Coordinator Holdt clarified the plan itself is comprised of recommendations. She said elementary school students have the least access to arts in schools, adding most high schools have a drama, dance, music, or visual-arts teacher, some middle schools have a combination teacher, and most elementary schools only have a music teacher who teaches instrumental music, and only for students who sign up. Coordinator Holdt reiterated the plan does not ensure that changes will be made, but rather provides recommendations for what should be in place. Dr. Edsall Giglio shared data that shows when the arts are sustained over time, they are most impactful.

Coordinator Holdt added the South San Francisco Unified District recently received a grant from the California Department of Education to turn their summer Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math (STEM) program into a Science, Technology, Engineering, Art, and Math (STEAM) program and train all of their teachers in arts integration. She reported it was a successful and well-received program and although the district Board hasn’t voted on the issue, the district is hoping to continue to sustain the program. Coordinator Holdt stated it is great when a district gets to see the impact of how the arts can completely transform learning and engagement.

Ms. Alvaro thanked Coordinator Holdt and Dr. Edsall Giglio for the report and for their work. She commented that her son and his classmates experienced a challenge in middle and high school when there were so many mandated, non-elective courses that it was impossible to take an elective arts course without taking a zero period. Ms. Alvaro acknowledged the need for more arts courses and said sometimes students do not have time for them. She shared a desire that 100% of students in San Mateo County and California have access to taking at least one art discipline each year, but the reality is that most students will never take an art course because there is no time.

Coordinator Holdt shared two solutions to that issue, the first being at the elementary level where all classroom teachers should be trained in arts integration so it can be seamlessly woven into the
INSTRUCTIONAL SERVICES (continued)

academics. She explained that both she and Dr. Edsall Giglio are arts integration specialists, and classroom teachers can be trained to integrate the arts, at a low cost to districts, to ensure elementary students are getting arts education. Secondly, she said a solution at the middle and high school levels is creative scheduling, and she would love to meet with school counselors and principal about creative scheduling and assigning students to art courses.

Dr. Edsall Giglio shared that teachers often are doubtful about their own artistic skills and ability to teach art and described arts integration as a scaffolded and sequenced set of events which do not require a fine arts degree. She said art can be folded into what teachers do already. She added for schools that cannot offer art programs to all students, one option is to offer one arts discipline per grade. She gave the example of every student in a certain grade taking a music course, which provides a sustained impact.

Mr. Hsiao recounted a conversation he had with a senior executive at Google in which he asked what training his children needed in order to work at Google. The Google executive suggested Mr. Hsiao help them to be creative, a sentiment he hears from both start-up entrepreneurs and executives at large firms. He elaborated on the need for creativity, design thinking, and the ability to take both concrete and abstract problems and reframe them through new ways of thinking. Mr. Hsiao said arts have been viewed as something to “squeeze in” but successful people view the arts as their core. Coordinator Holdt agreed that education should be led with creativity and learning. She described that students should be what Sir Ken Robinson calls divergent thinkers, and cited his study showing kindergarteners are the most divergent thinkers, but by 8th and 12th grade have lost their ability to think divergently. Coordinator Holdt also stated systemic changes must be made in school to ensure that learning remains creative and innovative.

Coordinator Holdt stated she is an advocate for arts in schools but is really an advocate for creativity and feels the arts teach 21st century skills – creativity, collaboration, communication, critical thinking, and cultural competency. She quoted from the strategic plan that “1,500 Chief Executive Officers surveyed by IBM ranked creativity as the most important leadership quality they are looking for in their workers, and 85 percent of those same executives cannot find the creative applicants they seek” (IBM Corporation, 2019).

Board President Camacho thanked Coordinator Holdt and Dr. Edsall Giglio for the report and recommendations. He added the work done by Mr. Broderick on the design of the plan is beautiful and incredibly well done. Board President Camacho then asked if the plan was available in other languages for the community. Coordinator Holdt stated the plan was designed to be placed into the hands of decision-makers, policy makers, teachers, and administrators, but an eventual goal is to have it available online in multiple languages. Board President Camacho stated families would see the value of arts education and would be interested in supporting this work. He again thanked Coordinator Holdt and Dr. Edsall Giglio for all their work.
7. **OFFICE OF THE SUPERINTENDENT**

A. Discuss/Act on the 90-Day Extension of Personnel Commissioner's Duties and Appointment by the Board of the Classified Employee's Nomination for New Appointee

Board President Camacho introduced Associate Superintendent, Human Resources/Teacher and Administrator Development, Lori Musso, who explained the Personnel Commission is comprised of three appointed positions. She said one position, that of Paul Scannell, is up for renewal. Paul Scannell has served on the Personnel Commission for 47 years, and although he is ready to step down when his term ends in December, he has agreed to a 90-day extension to allow the Classified School Employees Association (CSEA) to seat a replacement appointee. Associate Superintendent Musso explained the Board is asked to approve the extension of Mr. Scannell’s duties and to also approve the appointment of Veronica Palmer, a former and retired SMCOE employee, as recommended by CSEA. Associate Superintendent Musso explained according to the Merit Rules, the Board shall make the approval for the 90-day extension as well as the appointment of Ms. Palmer, beginning at the end of February.

Superintendent Magee suggested the Board take action with two separate motions. After a motion by Ms. Gerard and a second by Mr. Hsiao, the Board approved, by a vote of six in favor (Alvaro, Camacho, Cannon, Gerard, Hsiao, and Lempert), none opposed, and one absent (Ross), the 90-Day Extension of Personnel Commissioner, Paul Scannell. After a motion by Ms. Alvaro and a second by Mr. Lempert, the Board approved, by a vote of six in favor (Alvaro, Camacho, Cannon, Gerard, Hsiao, and Lempert), none opposed, and one absent (Ross), the appointment by the Board of the Classified Employee's Nomination for New Appointee, Veronica Palmer.

B. Discuss/Act on a 1.0 FTE Classified Position for Green Facilities and Operations Analyst, Office of the Superintendent

Associate Superintendent, Human Resources/Teacher and Administrator Development, Lori Musso described the Green Facilities and Operations Analyst as a new 1.0 FTE classified position. She shared the Personnel Commission would make a future recommendation for placement and classification of the position. Associate Superintendent Musso also shared she had met with two of the CSEA Union Presidents and their leadership teams to review the job description and answer their questions. She explained the position would support environmental literacy and sustainability and, the funding for one year, was obtained as a grant from San Mateo County’s Office of Sustainability, with a renewable second year. Associate Superintendent Musso said if the position is approved, it will be posted as a one-year position with the possibility of a second year.

Board President Camacho asked how the applicant pool is affected by a grant-based position of one year. Associate Superintendent Musso responded that Andra Yeghoian, Coordinator, Environmental Literacy and Sustainability, will oversee the position and feels there are people in the private sector who will apply. Board President Camacho asked if it was a 0.5 FTE position and Associate Superintendent Musso confirmed it was a 1.0 FTE position.

After a motion by Mr. Hsiao and a second by Ms. Gerard, the Board approved, by a vote of six in favor (Alvaro, Camacho, Cannon, Gerard, Hsiao, and Lempert), none opposed, and one absent
Board President Camacho introduced Associate Superintendent, Human Resources/Teacher and Administrator Development, Lori Musso who described the position as a 0.5 FTE management position for a project specialist utilizing Tobacco Use Prevention Education (TUPE) funds to support the work. Associate Superintendent Musso said the position has a specific emphasis on Court and Community Schools.

Ms. Alvaro thanked Associate Superintendent Musso for her explanations and asked which position had previously been doing the TUPE work, and if the work is different enough to justify an additional 0.5 position. Associate Superintendent Musso responded that a retired individual, Duke Williams, was originally hired for the position on a Personnel Services Agreement served in the position for many years. Deputy Superintendent Littrell added when hired, Theresa Vallez-Kelly, Coordinator, Safe Routes to Schools, took on health and wellness issues and worked with some of the same partners.

She explained when Mr. Williams retired, Ms. Vallez-Kelly absorbed some of the TUPE work into her current workload to support districts. Deputy Superintendent Littrell said the new position is supported by additional funding through the TUPE Health Disparities Grant to specifically work with populations such as Court and Community School students around drug and alcohol prevention which is a new scope of work for SMCOE school programs.

Ms. Alvaro asked if the new work was similar to what Mr. Williams did for many years. Deputy Superintendent Littrell confirmed this was accurate, adding Ms. Vallez-Kelly still supports districts in that work with the California Healthy Kids survey and making sure they have resources and information related to drugs, alcohol, and vaping. She explained the new funding is specific to the Court and Community Schools and is focused on providing curriculum and making sure SMCOE students gain drug refusal skills and an understanding of the impact of drugs and alcohol. Ms. Alvaro clarified that the funding was specifically for Court and Community Schools, and asked how many students were currently in these programs. Deputy Superintendent Littrell confirmed there were currently 84 students enrolled in the Court and Community Schools program. Ms. Alvaro asked if the position would also support local districts, which Deputy Superintendent Littrell confirmed was correct.

Mr. Cannon asked Associate Superintendent Musso about the funding for the Green Facilities and Operations Analyst position coming from the San Mateo County’s Office of Sustainability, and whether that was part of the special tax going to county programs for children. Associate Superintendent Musso answered she was not certain about the origination of the funding. Mr. Cannon stated the Office of Sustainability’s website reflects a number of issues being addressed, including climate change, energy and water, livable communities, and waste reduction. Associate Superintendent Musso explained that Coordinator Yeghoian is working with many community partners, and especially with the Office of Sustainability. She added the Office of Sustainability wants to support SMCOE’s work because of its connections to districts and school sites.
After a motion by Mr. Hsiao and a second by Ms. Gerard, the Board approved, by a vote of six in favor (Alvaro, Camacho, Cannon, Gerard, Hsiao, and Lempert), none opposed, and one absent (Ross), a 0.5 FTE Classified Position for Project Specialist, Tobacco Use Prevention Education (TUPE), Safe Routes to School Program, Student Services Division.

D. Superintendent’s Comments

Superintendent Magee began by sharing that Youth Commissioner Mufarreh will sit at the dais for a specific number of Board meetings, but would depart each meeting at 8:30 pm.

Superintendent Magee congratulated Coordinator Contreras on his new role as Chief Business Official in the Cabrillo Unified School District, sharing the County Office of Education would continue to support him in that new role. She added she is happy he will still be connected to SMCOE staff and that SMCOE can continue to support the Cabrillo Unified School District in navigating their current financial challenges.

Superintendent Magee shared since the Oxford Day Academy (ODA) charter renewal at the last Board meeting, SMCOE staff have been in contact with ODA leaders Dr. Dwinal and Dr. St. Roseman, as well as Superintendent Mary Streshly and Associate Superintendent Bonnie Hansen from the Sequoia Union High School District (SUHSD). She explained the most urgent focus has been addressing students who are now enrolled in SUHSD and what can be done to bring their academic records into the best alignment for future progress. All parties agreed to make this the first order of business after the renewal process, regardless of the outcome. Superintendent Magee said SUHSD students are being programmed into courses for spring semester, so it is important to move on this as soon as possible. She added Deputy Superintendent Littrell has been working with both ODA and SUHSD to organize an initial in-person meeting with all parties.

Superintendent Magee asked the Board about having a liaison from the Board participate and engage with the charter oversight process. She offered one option to select a Board representative at the January Board meeting during the subcommittee assignment process. Superintendent Magee described the focus between January and April will be on working through the approval conditions and including those elements in the MOU. She explained a second option is to agendize the appointment of the Board representative at the December meeting. Mr. Cannon asked if there would be an initial meeting prior to January and whether it would be important for a Board member to attend for relationship-building. Superintendent Magee said there may be an initial meeting around the second week in December.

Ms. Alvaro stated Counsel has recommended in the past that if a subcommittee is not being formed, the Board President can simply appoint a representative that evening with no need to agendize the item. She added perhaps Mr. Ross could serve as the representative as he had previously agreed to do so, and since he has a busy calendar he would be able to coordinate his calendar to accommodate the December meeting. Board President Camacho agreed Board policy allows the Board President to select a representative. He agreed if the first meeting was about relationship-building, it was important for a Board member to attend, as there are concerns from SUHSD, at the Board level, regarding what happens next. Board President Camacho then recommended Mr. Ross, on behalf of the Board, serve as
Office of the Superintendent (continued)

the Board representative in this process, and to attend the initial meeting if he was available. He requested to follow up with a formal action as part of the January subcommittee assignment process.

Superintendent Magee shared she participated on a cross-agency panel with law enforcement, behavioral health, and human services, at a First Five San Mateo County-sponsored event focused on the impact of trauma for children, families, and staff in early childhood. She reported it was a positive event with many great ideas and engaging speakers, and she was honored to be a part of the conversation.

Superintendent Magee shared on Tuesday, the California Suite was filled with students and adults attending the second annual Youth Advocacy and Social Summit (YAASS) conference, specifically supporting LGBTQ+ students and their adult allies on school campuses. She thanked Deputy Superintendent Littrell and her team including Mary McGrath, Director, Safe and Supportive Schools and Molly Henricks, Coordinator, School Safety and Risk Prevention, for their work putting on a robust day for students that included break-out sessions for students, for adults and for adults and students together. Superintendent Magee estimated 60 students and 50 adults participated, and noted it was a highly successful event that SMCOE looks forward to continuing on an annual basis.

Superintendent Magee stated earlier in the day she had the pleasure of attending the Policy, Partnerships, and Practice: Intersections for Early School Success Conference, a regional convening about preschool through third grade alignment. She was joined by Board Members Lempert and Hsiao and was able to attend the entire day as well as speak on a panel in the morning and close the event at the end of the day. Superintendent Magee shared that Elliott Regenstein, one of the speakers, from Chicago has completed a significant body of research and academic writing about student data, how it's used, and what it tells us. She added Mr. Regenstein uses the approach of Sean Reardon, a researcher at Stanford University, who applies a unique lens to analyzing data that dives deeply into how some schools are getting better outcomes for traditionally underperforming students.

Superintendent Magee shared that several weeks ago, County Counsel John Beiers brought a question to all district Superintendents about the possibility of joining a class-action lawsuit against the electronic cigarette vender, Juul, based in San Francisco. She added there are school districts across the country joining in suits against the company and Congresswoman Speier has asked if local school districts have interest in taking up the fight. Superintendent Magee clarified that Superintendents can individually make decisions on whether they wish to join the lawsuit, and she had offered if enough school districts choose to join, SMCOE would coordinate the effort. She reminded the Board that the TUPE program put on a vaping summit for school leaders early this year. Superintendent Magee indicated she was interested in participating in the lawsuit but has additional questions for Counsel Beiers. She shared a next step would be to ask Counsel Beiers to attend a future Board meeting in closed session to discuss the lawsuit. She will reach out to the Counsel Beiers to organize for the December or January Board meeting.

Superintendent Magee wished a happy birthday to Deputy Superintendent Porterfield on December 9. Lastly, Superintendent Magee invited the Board to the One SMCOE holiday celebration on December 11, informing them invitations would be sent out soon.
8. BOARD MEMBERS

A. Discuss Updates on Excess Property Tax for County Offices of Education

Mr. Hsiao summarized that Senator Hill reiterated his willingness to help deliver the message to Governor Newsom about the importance of the excess property tax issue. Mr. Hsiao added that an eleventh county, Riverside County, has joined the list of Excess Property Tax COEs and has more than 400,000 students who would benefit from receiving the funding for services. Mr. Hsiao said four counties have signed the Board letter and asked Superintendent Magee if the letters for the Superintendents were completed and delivered to the Governor’s office. Superintendent Magee confirmed that they were. She also added that the Board members from Placer, Napa, and San Luis Obispo counties are signing letters between now and their respective December Board meeting dates.

Mr. Hsiao added how inequitable it is that County Offices of Education are denied excess property taxes and yet all other local Basic Aid districts receive those funds. Mr. Hsiao stated things are moving along, and he believes the meeting with Department of Finance staff will happen soon. Superintendent Magee noted that two meeting dates are being considered soon after Thanksgiving.

B. Discuss Updates from Outdoor Education Subcommittee Meeting

Mr. Hsiao shared that two weeks ago, he, Ms. Alvaro, and Mr. Cannon met jointly with the YMCA, who brought Rachel Del Monte, the YMCA of San Francisco District Vice-President, as well as Chris McComick, the new Vice-President of Property Development. He shared it was helpful that Ms. Alvaro was able to discuss construction development. Mr. Hsiao reminded his colleagues that last March a 25-year lease agreement was signed with the YMCA which opened the door to doing some capital investments, such as building residential properties for the Principal and Program Director at Jones Gulch, along with intern housing. He added the meeting was about looking at potential sites for resident housing at Jones Gulch, and the YMCA officials shared initial analyses sketching out the costs and benefits of different locations. Mr. Hsiao shared the recommendation that the group go out to Jones Gulch and take a look at potential sites.

Ms. Alvaro shared her appreciation and gratitude for Mr. Hsiao’s leadership, as he is making sure SMCOE moves forward with a mutually positive relationship with the YMCA. She stated Mr. Hsiao has kept the team focused and many positive things are happening, including the meeting where multiple representatives of the YMCA were talking with the Outdoor Education Subcommittee about what is desired for the program. Ms. Alvaro said the meeting was positive. She spoke of both Mark Nolan, Director of Outdoor Education, and Steve Van Zandt, Site Director/Principal of Outdoor Education, who currently live in La Honda expressing their concern about hiring replacements when they retire. Ms. Alvaro stated residents of La Honda cannot be the only people considered as candidates for the position. She reminded the Board there is not a lot of housing available in La Honda and explained that new housing at Jones Gulch, would allow any candidate with the right qualifications can be considered. She said hopes that YMCA officials can come speak to the Board at a future Board meeting once decisions have been made.

Mr. Cannon added at the meeting he had forgotten about Ms. Alvaro’s construction experience which was apparent and the YMCA officials were impressed with her participation in the discussion about
boards and laws. He recalled a meeting with Superintendent Holbrook roughly 10 years earlier when this process began and how Mr. Hsiao has done a wonderful job seeing it through. Mr. Cannon commented that, “They can never take away,” the legacy of Outdoor Education. Mr. Hsiao thanked Mr. Cannon for his comments and congratulated Ms. Alvaro for being able to “talk shop” with the YMCA officials. He also thanked Deputy Superintendent Porterfield for her assistance with the first teacher/administration housing being built.

C. Board Member Comments

Ms. Gerard
Ms. Gerard shared she thought the evening was interesting and the student musicians from San Mateo High School was both a wonderful way to begin the meeting and to promote the arts. Ms. Gerard commented it was also nice to be joined by Youth Commissioner Mufarrreh. She informed the Board she would not be attending the December Board meeting and reminded the Board that Mr. Ross would be the Board’s voting representative at the California County Boards of Education (CCBE) General Membership Breakfast meeting at the December California School Boards Association (CSBA) conference in San Diego. Any comments about those running for office should be shared with him. Lastly, she wished everyone a happy Thanksgiving, happy holidays, and happy New Year.

Mr. Hsiao
Mr. Hsiao thanked Associate Superintendent Musso for the collective bargaining primer. He then echoed Superintendent Magee’s comments about the Policy, Partnerships, and Practice: Intersections for Early School Success Conference earlier in the day, sharing the results of a longitudinal study across multiple school districts showing if a student is one grade below grade-level entering kindergarten, when tracked over the years they never catch up. He added students are even more worse off when they begin two grade levels behind. Mr. Hsiao shared hopes to continue the momentum to invest in intervention and early learning.

Mr. Cannon
Mr. Cannon shared the annual fall PTA Superintendent lunch was a nice event, as always, and it was great to hear the issues in which Superintendents are engaged and how they are improving education for their students. He said he and his wife attended the funeral service for Nattie Fong, a leader in the County PTA, who passed away a month ago, and asked if the Board could do something in her honor. Superintendent Magee answered yes. Mr. Cannon thanked Mr. Ross for his excellent work on the excess property tax issue and agreed with the comments from his colleagues about the evening and the holidays. Lastly, he reflected upon the ODA charter renewal at the previous meeting and the respectful opinions, comments, questions, and concerns shared, from which he learned a great deal. Mr. Cannon noted not all Boards function in such a way, and he thanked his colleagues.

Ms. Alvaro
Ms. Alvaro said she was sorry to see Coordinator Contreras leave SMCOE as he has been solid and detail-oriented with a grasp on the bigger picture allowing her to understand issues on a deeper level. She knows the Cabrillo Unified School District will be well served. She also shared feeling sorry that Cameron Lewis had also left SMCOE, as he too was wonderful to work with. Lastly, Ms. Alvaro shared that Edna Letran has left SMCOE for a brand-new position at the College of San Mateo (CSM)
BOARD MEMBERS (continued)

as the Executive Assistant to the new President. She said she enjoyed attending the farewell celebration for Ms. Letran and wished her the best in her new position.

Mr. Lempert
Mr. Lempert added a thank you to the Outdoor Education Subcommittee, especially Mr. Hsiao for his leadership. He then complimented Superintendent Magee on her sensational work representing the Board and the County Office of Education at the Policy, Partnerships, and Practice: Intersections for Early School Success Conference earlier in the day.

Board President Camacho
Board President Camacho thanked all who presented that evening.

9. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 9:25 p.m.

Nancy Magee, Secretary
jlp